A RETROSPECTIVE/PROSPECTIVE COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE LEAD PROJECT IN SOKOTO & BAUCHI STATES

INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT CONDUCTED BY:
dEVELOPMENT RESEARCH AND PROJECTS CENTER (dRPC)
AUGUST 2018
THE STORY WE ARE PRESENTING TODAY!

- Background of RTI-LEAD Project
- Justification for the study
- Methodology
  - Research Design
  - Research Questions
  - Study Location
  - Study Population
  - Sampling
  - Data collection
- Key Findings
- Conclusion & Recommendations
The Leadership Empowerment Advocacy & Development (LEAD) is a 9 year (2009-2018) cooperative agreement funded by USAID as part of the focused state strategy of USAID in Bauchi & Sokoto states.

- Addressing demand and supply sides of local government service improves accountability and development and effective system.
- Sokoto twelve (12) LGAs
- Bauchi eight (8) LGAs
The Leadership Empowerment Advocacy & Development (LEAD) is a 9 year (2009-2018) cooperative agreement funded by USAID as part of the focused state strategy of USAID in Bauchi & Sokoto states.

- Addressing demand and supply sides of local government service improves accountability and development and effective system.
- Sokoto twelve (12) LGAs
- Bauchi eight (8) LGAs
PROJECT OBJECTIVES (SA&SI)

▪ SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY (SA)
  ▪ Building relations with communities & effective management of services.
  ▪ Facilitating dialogue to increase citizen access to information and local decision making.
  ▪ Increase transparency of local government operations (PBP, monitoring, Fiscal Responsibility and Public Procurement Laws).
  ▪ Strengthening CSOs on service planning, budgeting and monitoring.

▪ SERVICE IMPROVEMENT (SI)
  ▪ Water and sanitation
  ▪ Education
  ▪ Health
WHY A RESTROSPECTIVE/PROSPECTIVE COMPARATIVE STUDY?

▪ RTI-LEAD’s 2015 Community Scorecard (low perception of governance, role of elected officials was viewed very poorly).

▪ At the same time, all communities indicated that conditions in service delivery and governance had improved in the prior three years.

▪ Hence, the need for a retrospective/prospective study to examine qualitative change along dimensions not reflected in the other M&E processes.
RESEARCH DESIGN

Qualitative research, multi-methods approach (KII & FGD).

Combined retrospective/prospective comparative points of inquiry in determining past and future target area trends related to RTI-LEAD intervention.

Retrospective (past trends), Prospective (forecast for the future).
RESEARCH QUESTIONS & STUDY LOCATIONS IN BAUCHI & SOKOTO STATES

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- How has the relationship between citizens and the local government changed over the 8-year project period?
- Have attitudes (mutual respect openess) changed for both sets of stakeholders?
- Have citizen and LGA attitudes toward the potential for change and improvement in local services and governance changed?
- In what areas (services/sectors) do citizens and government officials feel there have been the most changes and the least changes?
- How do citizens and officials feel about the future of their community?

STUDY LOCATIONS

BAUCHI

Intervention
- Ningi (Urban),
- Misau (Urban)
- Dass (Rural)

Control
- Ganjuwa (rural)

SOKOTO

Intervention
- Wammako (urban)
- Illela (urban)
- Kebbe (rural)

Control
- Kware (Urban)
STRATIFICATION OF STUDY POPULATION

Government Officials
- Elected or appointed council members
- LGA Heads of Administration
- Service Directors
- Sectional Heads
- Representatives of Ministry of LGA’s

Community Members/ Representatives
- Traditional Leaders
- Women’s groups
- CSOs/CBOs
- Business Men/ Women
- WDC Representatives
- Other community members
428 RESPONDENTS SAMPLED IN BAUCHI & SOKOTO STATES

- A combination of sampling techniques was applied in selecting 428 participants for the study (LGA: 424, State: 4).
- LGA Officials, Women groups, civil society organizations and community based organizations (Purposive)
- Community members (systematic random sampling disaggregated by gender)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATES</th>
<th>BAUCHI</th>
<th>SOKOTO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RESPONDENTS</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Ethical considerations (informed consent).
OVERARCHING FINDINGS

FROM SUBJECTS TO CITIZENS
FROM EXCLUSION TO INCLUSION
FROM SECRECY TO TRANSPARENCY
"the relationship between the citizens and the LGA is now friendly after RTI-LEAD because the LGA does things transparently and whatever it will do it consults the citizens for advice. We don't just do things on our own anymore. They all contribute because if we don't involve the people it can become a problem for us in the future“… LGA Official from Urban Intervention LGA in Sokoto state
FROM SUBJECTS TO INFORMED AND ENGAGED CITIZENS - PERSPECTIVES IN URBAN & RURAL INTERVENTION LGAS

"Yes, as a result of RTI-LEAD the LGA officials now relates well with us as citizens and as groups in the community such as Community-based Organizations & WDCs“… Community member from Intervention LGA in Bauchi state.

"I am the Chairman of WDC Forum….Before the coming of RTI-LEAD project it’s difficult to meet with big people except during wedding and naming ceremonies, but now RTI-LEAD project has created the platforms to bring together the LGA and the citizens“… WDC Chairman from Intervention LGA in Sokoto state.

"L.G.A officials were anxious in mingling with the community in their activities because they see it as interfering in their activities. But with LEAD the L.G.A now understand that the citizens did not come to interfere in their works but rather they come in order to assist them in executing some projects. It really helped"….Community members from Urban Intervention LGA in Bauchi state.
Access to financial documents improved through awareness creation and Participatory Budget Processes…

- "back then, [before RTI-LEAD] the budget used to be a very confidential document, no one knew what it contained and how it was expected to be spent but with the coming of RTI-LEAD… the LG and citizens now know there should be transparency and community involvement in the governance of the community. Citizens now follow up on everything the LG does with regard to the budget and they raise alarm when things are not going on well“… Chairman of Budget Advocacy Group intervention LGA Sokoto state

- "The greatest achievement was that people came to realize that the monies released by the government is what is used to fund the budget. They got to know that it is with the revenue of the LG that we fund the budget. We conducted rallies in the market and created awareness for the people in the community“…LGA Official from Intervention LGA Bauchi state
**EXPLORING CHANGING RELATIONSHIPS**

**(GENDER INCLUSION)**

**BAUCHI STATE**

- “truly women are our parents and I will say their contributions have been good...they bring their complains, they will sit with us and get us to improve on the things; they have really played a vital role. Anytime RTI-LEAD do meetings with women they bring their wisdom“... Official from Intervention LGA in Bauchi state

- "honestly the men involved in the decision making don’t tell us anything, they leave us out and our husbands do not allow us to go out. We clean the hospital; there is also a drainage system, and we clean“.... Community members from Control LGA in Bauchi state

**SOKOTO STATE**

- “On the part of women there is a program called 'gender' where women are carried along. The women leader and her members are always with us anywhere as well as FOMWAN and the rest of their associations. So, through LEAD program women have progressed, they were not left behind in the progress of the society because they are also parents...” LGA Official from Intervention LGA in Sokoto state

- "We don’t associate with women, they don’t play any role.“... LGA Official in Control LGA in Sokoto state
"There is much improvement in water. I can recall sometime ago LEAD conducted training on water sanitation improvement and trained some CSOs, SBMC and WDC from different Wards to conduct a search on the purity and source of water. They also give them equipment to go and repair any borehole in their Ward and called another meeting to check how many boreholes were functioning". (Male community member intervention LGA Bauchi state).
AREAS OF SERVICES/ SECTORS WITH THE MOST CHANGES IN SOKOTO STATE

- "it is in the health and education sectors. Back then it used to be 0% but now we can rate them at a 90% improvement as a result of this RTI-LEAD project“ …Chairman WDC Intervention LGA Sokoto state

- "back then, [before RTI-LEAD] the budget used to be a very confidential document, no one knew what it contained and how it was expected to be spent but with the coming of RTI-LEAD… the LG citizens now know there should be Transparency and community involvement in the governance of the community. Citizens now follow up on everything the LG does with regard to the budget and they raise alarm when things are not going on well“… Chairman of Budget Advocacy Group Intervention LGA Sokoto state
As I said earlier, the education sector is the least developed sector in this local government. We want RTI-LEAD to come in. If RTI-LEAD can intervene, please let it intervene so that it raises that standard of education in the area so that it flourishes…” LGA Official in intervention LGA in Bauchi state

“There is problem in education; materials don’t come. Pupils and teachers task themselves to buy chalk. The school feeding should be translated to materials. Also teachers are posted directly from states to schools without the knowledge of RTI-LEAD, the teachers should be taken from host communities. RTI-LEAD should be allowed to post teachers. Teaching is very poor, there is no foundation, pupils cannot read and write…” Community members at Female FGD in Bauchi state
AREAS OF SERVICES/ SECTORS WITH THE LEAST CHANGES IN SOKOTO STATE

- “The sector that has the least change is that of the water sanitation, because we still have issues of getting clean and healthy water in various communities…” Male Budget Advocacy Coalition Chairman in Intervention LGA Sokoto state

- “You cannot say all have not been improved, but there is some sector that demand for improvement like water sanitation, need to be improved likewise education sector also requires additional seats. You know the population is increasing, what we have we thank God, but there is need for improvement…” LGA Official in Intervention LGA in Sokoto state

- “I think its education because there is need for improvement in the sector, is not it's very weak but it needs some improvement…” LGA Official in Intervention LGA in Sokoto state
CITIZENS AND OFFICIALS PROSPECTS FOR THE FUTURE OF IN BAUCHI STATE

• “There is a lot of success, but if you look the aspect of governance, there is need for improvement and training. You see if they (RTI-LEAD) leave, we would go back to before, you see this is a problem. Secondly is the aspect of education, there is need for a lot of enrolment & training, hence the need to change people’s habit and ensure success is more than the failure…” CSO Representative from Intervention LGA in Bauchi state

• “Among the aspects which RTI LEAD gave intervention, the most promising for development is health sector, because before the RTI LEAD there were interventions like TSHIP by USAID, etc. Likewise education is promising for development, but the one least for development is aspect of governance…” Community member from Intervention LGA Bauchi state
“Right now, we are working on the areas of education and health sector and also good governance. If we maintain these 3 then I think they are the major aspects of development and if they are improved then all other sectors will work out really well...” LGA Official in Intervention LGA Sokoto state

“Health is the most promising. If you compare what used to be in the past and now there is improvement. Traditional and religious leaders do bring children for immunization now. I am optimistic that in the future, people will be taking their children on their own to hospital for immunization...” LGA Official in Intervention LGA Sokoto state

“...education is least promising because education is weaker than those other two sectors (water sanitation & health)...” LGA Official in Intervention LGA Sokoto state
CONCLUSION

- The impact evaluation of the RTI-LEAD project conducted by the dRPC over a five month period, has surveyed the views of over 428 respondents in Bauchi & Sokoto states to examine and address the research questions above.

- A status quo of disengagement, social distance, isolation and exclusion between local authority and disempowered subjects existed prior to the RTI-LEAD project.

- However, from the responses of officials and community members, the study documented how this status quo ante was transformed to a new reality of engagement, inclusion and broad based integrated planning and programming.

- Findings also pointed to the embedded nature of the intervention after an 8 year timeline and the fact that capacity was built on both the demand and supply sides of local governance.
Community engagement is important for community ownership, but it has to be strategic, deliberate and constructively aligned to the overall project/programmatic aspirations.

One of the key takeaways of RTI-LEAD project is the change of mindset of community members towards self-help and community ownership.

Taken too far, this has the potential of eroding the ideal model of a symbiotic local governance system. Future design could learn from the conceptual balance between community self-help and commitment advocacy.
OBSERVATIONS/LESSONS LEARNT

▪ Using existing local structures and systems could yield immense results and help with sustainability.

For instance, contrary to the general belief that citizens are usually unwilling to pay taxes, there were stories of traders aiding in revenue collection.

▪ Public expenditure tracking is a crucial sensitive bridge to transparency and accountability. RTI-LEAD project offer a unique model of how mutual trust could translate to synergy between government and community members on project monitoring and supervision.

▪ Diffusion of innovation was noticeable through staff movement across LGAs. However, more systemic tracking would have made it the outcomes less random.
RECOMMENDATIONS

**RTI LEAD**

- More effective strategy for inclusion which allows greater role for women, PWD and youth as real drivers of the development agenda.
- In the areas of community ownership, RTI-LEAD was able to transcend the widely held linear notion of community engagement.
- However, ownership was not even across interventions. For instance, water and sanitation, engagement and dialogues, PBP, THMs were stronger than IPAS.
- For the purpose of learning, adaptation, replication, extension or expansion, RTI-LEAD could pull knowledge from components with stronger and more effective community ownership for application.
RECOMMENDATIONS

THE GOVERNMENT (National & State)

- Continuous education and sensitization of state government leaders (Governors and State Assemblies) and officials (Ministry of Local Government and LG Service Commission)
- Change of attitude and different mindset to foster an autonomous (or semi-autonomous) local government structure well resourced enough to meet its obligations as the third tier of government.
- Amendment of sections 7 and 162 of the 1999 Constitution (as amended) which grant the state government sweeping powers over the LGAs, and by so doing, emasculates political, administrative and financial autonomy of LGAs
RECOMMENDATIONS

Champion LGAs

- Champion LGAs could consider setting up a RTI-LEAD Project Sustainability Committees
- The primary responsibility of the Committee would be to oversee the continuation of the RTI-LEAD legacies.

Community/ CSOs

- Each cluster of community members could set up special dedicated RTI-LEAD units within their groups
- The sole purpose would be to ensure continued sustenance of the tradition of open, transparent, inclusive and developmental local governance.
THANK YOU